

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS – CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION

### Date of Hub Review:

November 3, 2006

### Participants:

Laura Timothy, BART; Carolyn Clevenger, MTC; Ron Niewiarowski, SFMTA; Lisa Young, SFCTA; Paul Guthlein, Golden Gate Transit; Carol Levine, WSA; Harley Goldstrom, HA.

### Existing Hub Conditions:

The Civic Center BART/Muni Station is an underground station located in Downtown San Francisco within close proximity to City Hall and numerous federal, state and municipal office buildings. The station has eight street entrances on Market Street between 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> Streets. The regional hub also includes street-level transit service. The Muni F Line Historic Streetcar operates on Market Street and numerous Muni bus routes have stops on Market and cross-streets. Regional bus service is provided by SamTrans (to San Mateo County) with stops on Mission Street and by Golden Gate Transit (to Marin County) with stops on Mission, Howard, Hyde and McAllister Streets. All-Nighter bus service is also available on Market and Mission Streets with service within San Francisco and to the Peninsula and East Bay.

## CORRECTIVE ACTIONS

### WAYFINDING:

This regional hub includes two different components: the Civic Center Station and street-level bus and streetcar stops. The Station has wayfinding signage but much of this is out-dated, inconsistent and no longer operable. Entry and exit wayfinding is incomplete and difficult to distinguish from other station and street signage. Additionally, there is limited wayfinding connection between the underground station and street-level facilities. Bus stop flags and shelters for Muni stops are relatively new and highly visible. Golden Gate Transit and SamTrans stops are hard to find; the bus stops are poorly marked on the street. There is limited direction from the Civic Center BART/Muni Station to all connecting bus services. The transit operators and customers that use these facilities would benefit from an expanded, updated and consistent wayfinding system that respects the architectural integrity of the Civic Center Station and surrounding buildings while providing easy to read, easy to find, hierarchical information to direct customers between transit services in a convenient and accessible manner.

Wayfinding program corrective actions should include but not be limited to:

#### Identification of station or transit operator

- Provide clearer definition of entrances to the hub. Include station name and operator logos (BART and Muni). Make sure that the sign size/design is distinguishable from other signage on the street. (see checklist questions #1, 3, 5; photos #1, 2);
- Establish a consistent name for the hub and reinforce this name on all signs, schedules and printed materials (see checklist question #4). This station is referred to as both Civic Center Station and Civic Center/UN Plaza Station.

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS – CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION

### Moving around or entering or exiting the station

- Improve exiting directional signage to include street name, cross streets, street-level transit connections and possible destinations. Ensure that exit signage is included at all decision points both on platforms and concourse levels (see checklist questions #9, 10, 11, 14; photos #3, 4, 5);
- Ensure that directional signage is consistent throughout the hub and of an adequate height, location and contrast to be clearly visible. This should include street-level wayfinding which directs to transit as well as key destinations (see checklist question #15; photos #3, 6, 7);
- Include transit operator logos on signage to underground BART and Muni Metro trains and street-level Muni, Golden Gate and SamTrans buses and streetcars (see checklist questions #6, 8; photos #7, 8, 9).
- MTC will work with a transit operator who will take the lead on the development of a comprehensive and consistent wayfinding program, including providing funding for program development and P S & E costs.

### Identification of where to board or wait for transit

- Provide better identification of boarding area for inbound and outbound trains on Muni Metro platform (see checklist question #17);
- Improve visibility of identification of Golden Gate and SamTrans bus stops on adjacent streets, specifically Mission, Howard, McAllister and Hyde Streets (see checklist questions #11, 17; photo #10);
- Generally Muni bus stops are well-marked. However, bus stop flags at island bus stops are parallel to the street and therefore are not visible from any distance. If possible, route identification perpendicular to the street should be provided either on the bus shelters or with additional bus stop flags (see checklist question #24; photos 11, 12, 13);
- Include All-Nighter service route numbers and logos on appropriate bus shelters (see checklist question #25);
- Add bus schedule information at Golden Gate Transit bus stops (see checklist question #25; photo #14).

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS – CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION

### CUSTOMER INFORMATION:

Customer information is currently dispersed throughout the hub in a variety of formats and accuracies. Customer information displays should be coordinated with wayfinding signage at key locations. The following customer information elements should be addressed:

#### Regional Transit Information (RTIC)

Two RTICs currently exist on the concourse level of the Civic Center Station. These installations include BART, Muni, SamTrans and Golden Gate transit information as well as hub and local vicinity maps (photos #15 - 19). The RTICs do not include information for the nine-county Bay Area although out-dated regional transit diagrams are posted nearby. The following recommendations are proposed:

- The RTIC would include (see checklist questions # 26-27):
  1. The regional 511.org transit map; and
  2. Subregional or system map for local operators.
- Existing RTIC locations are suitable for improved RTIC installations. Combine with local transit information whenever possible and include direction to the RTIC in the wayfinding signage program;
- Remove out-dated regional transit connection signage (photo #20).

#### Local Transit Information

The existing RTICs also include local transit information as mentioned above. Some of the information, particularly hub layout and local vicinity maps, are outdated or inaccurate. Additional local transit and vicinity information is posted at various locations throughout the hub and is available at both Muni and BART information kiosks and station agent booths (photos #21 - 23). Checklist comments suggest the following improvements.

- Local transit information would include (see checklist questions #29-30):
  1. Subregional or system map for local operators;
  2. Schedules and service hours;
  3. Fares and specific system information;
  4. Hub layout map; and
  5. Local vicinity map.
- Combine local transit information with the two RTIC installations on the concourse level of the Civic Center Station (see checklist question #28);
- Centralize customer information displays so they are easy to find (see checklist question #31);
- Include all transit boarding locations on hub layout and hub vicinity maps. In particular, the Golden Gate Transit and SamTrans stops should be included on these maps and directional signage (see checklist questions #29, 30);
- Additional useful local information could be provided at station exits such as hub layout and local vicinity maps (see checklist questions #29, 30).

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS – CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION

- At street-level, provide local vicinity maps including location of bus stops at frequent intervals (see checklist question #30).
- Use consistent and easily understood identifiers for information displays (i.e. big 'i' or '?') to distinguish from other signage in the area (see checklist question #31);
- Customer information could be improved through real-time scrolling message signs placed at the agent booths or central locations (see checklist question #19);
- Install consistent Braille signs on all bus stop poles and/or shelters. Use mounting hardware that allows for changeable route information (see checklist question #20);

### REAL-TIME SIGNAGE:

#### Existing Real-Time Signage

Existing real-time signage is located at:

- BART platforms and station agent booth.
- Muni platform and primary station agent booth (photo #24).

#### Future Real-Time Signage Installations

- In addition to existing signage, one real-time installation on the concourse level central to both the BART and Muni station agent booths. This signage should include both Muni and BART train information. If successful, an additional sign could be posted in the other station agent booth area.

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS - CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION

### STATION PHOTOGRAPHS



1. One entrance to the Civic Center BART/Muni Station



2. Artist's rendering of improved entry signage for Embarcadero Station.



3. Wayfinding signage from platform is not lit up.



4. Exit sign to street.



MTC Regional Transit Hub Performance Review Project

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS - CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION



5. No directional signage at this exit.



6. Directional signage exists but is not clearly visible or easy to read.



7. Some signs are handwritten or in different blue format for other signs.



8. Sign at entrance to BART is small and does not include operator logo.



9. Entrance sign to station from street is not highly visible and does not include logos.



10. Golden Gate identification on this bus shelter is too small. Note there is no stop flag.



# HUB REVIEW FINDINGS - CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION



11. Muni bus stop flag. Very readable and distinct.



12. Muni bus stop flag including All-Nighter service.



13. Bus stop flag at island stop is difficult to read by pedestrians walking down Market Street.



14. Golden Gate Transit map in bus shelter.



MTC Regional Transit Hub Performance Review Project

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS - CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION



15. One of two RTICs.



16. 2<sup>nd</sup> RTIC installation.



17. Local Area Map included in one RTIC and other locations in station.



18. Map of bus boarding locations included in both RTICs.



19. Golden Gate/SamTrans maps and schedules..



20. Out-dated regional transit information which should be removed.



MTC Regional Transit Hub Performance Review Project

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS - CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION



21. Muni information included in bus shelters.



22. Transit and local area information display in station.



23. Muni and BART information kiosks.



24. Real-time information in Muni agent booth.

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS - CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION

Hub Review Checklist Summary			
			WAYFINDING
Yes	No	N/A	
			<b>Identification of station or transit operator</b>
5	3		<p>1. The hub is clearly identified, visible from surrounding roadways by vehicular and pedestrian traffic.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• BART signs are old and not particularly visible. Muni symbol is helpful because it is consistent on bus shelters and underground entrance.</li> <li>• BART/Muni lollypops are difficult to see.</li> <li>• Civic Center UN plaza signs, and signs above staircases are good</li> </ul>
3	3		<p>2. Entrances into the hub are clearly identified, visible from approaches by vehicular and pedestrian traffic.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• BART/Muni signs are small and make it difficult to identify the entrances.</li> </ul>
6	1		<p>3. Transit operators serving the hub are clearly identified at the entrances with their logo and name.</p>
3	4		<p>4. Station identification reinforces information on printed maps and schedules.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Outside signs do not identify what station it is.</li> <li>• Station is sometimes called Civic Center or Civic Center/ UN Plaza Station</li> <li>• The "UN Plaza" is not widely known to be included as part of the station name.</li> </ul>
3	4		<p>5. Station name is identified on the entrance sign along with agency logo.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Name of hub needs to be located at each entrance and on bus shelters</li> <li>• Not all entrances are labeled with the station name.</li> <li>• City has added station signs which do not include BART/Muni logos</li> <li>• Outside the station name is difficult/impossible to locate (BART)</li> </ul>
			<b>Moving around or entering or exiting the station</b>
Yes	No	N/A	
4	2		<p>6. Agency logos are included with names on directional signs within the facility.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Muni subway signs within BART are good</li> <li>• Not all signs include logos</li> <li>• Signs to street service is poor</li> </ul>
1	3		<p>7. Turnstile level street exit directional signs also include connection agency names and logs.</p>
4	1		<p>8. Vital connections information is grouped together on signs.</p>

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS - CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION

1	4		<p>9. Connection directions are provided at each decision point and there are no gaps in the connection directional information flow.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Connection to Muni underground is good but no other directional signage</li> <li>• Connection directions from BART exits via street signs. However, no direction is included.</li> <li>• Limited directional signage except at street exits.</li> </ul>
1	4		<p>10. Exiting directional signs list a hierarchy of the popular destinations and connecting services to reach these destinations.</p>
	6		<p>11. Where connecting transit service is not within the station, clear directional signage (including walking distance) is provided to these services. All sign placement complies with 2004 ADAAG guidelines.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Some signs are placed too high, not easily seen</li> <li>• Connectivity service is not very clear, especially on the stop location and frequency of service.</li> <li>• No directional signage to buses</li> </ul>
2	3		<p>12. In stations with multiple track/gate or train/ferry service, confirmation of agency, destination, and real-time departure is associated with those services.</p>
1	2		<p>13. Clear sightlines are maintained to signs and all sign placement complies with 2004 ADAAG guidelines.</p>
1	5		<p>14. Exiting connection information is color-coded to emphasize and make it easier to find directions and connections.</p>
3	2		<p>15. Signs are legible with adequate message size appropriate for viewing distance, proper contrast ratios, and illumination levels.</p>
3	2		<p>16. Arrows are of consistent design and are bold in visual balance with text and are closely associated with their messages.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• BART/Muni arrows are consistent.</li> <li>• There are so many signs on Market it is hard to see the transit signs.</li> </ul>
			<b>Identification of where to board or wait for transit</b>
Yes	No	N/A	
3	2		<p>17. Transit boarding platforms are clearly and boldly identified.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Muni Metro does not clearly identify the inbound/outbound train pick up platforms.</li> <li>• Difficult to see Muni boarding platforms, especially center platforms.</li> </ul>
3	2	1	<p>18. Where a particular transit route utilizes different boarding points for opposite directions of travel, directional signage is provided to the different boarding point including platform route number, name, and route terminus (a place name).</p>
4	1		<p>19. At commuter rail, ferry terminals or bus stations, the boarding area identification number is large and bold with service agency, destination, number, and "real-time" departure is provided.</p>



## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS - CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION

5	4		<p>20. Schedule frequency and last departure information are provided at transit boarding platforms and are consistent with 2004 ADAAG guidelines.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Golden Gate Transit only provides a map but not schedule</li> <li>• Muni provides a map at curbside stops but does not do so on island shelters.</li> <li>• Some BART schedules are too high</li> </ul>
5	3		<p>21. Bus stop signs have agency logos large and bold.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sign with agency logos is too small</li> <li>• Golden Gate Transit logo is small and old</li> </ul>
3	3	1	<p>22. Bus stop signs have accessibility and parking restrictions as auxiliary signs below the basic bus stop signs.</p>
4	2		<p>23. Bus route identification on bus stop signs comply with 2004 ADAAG Guidelines - minimum 2" route number character height.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Some signs are too high for ADA compliance</li> </ul>
4	1		<p>24. Bus stop sign faces are visible from each approach direction.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bus stop sign faces are not visible on Muni islands</li> <li>• Some signs are only visible from certain approaches</li> </ul>
5	1		<p>25. Bus shelters have associated bus stop signs which are consistent with the design guidelines described in this checklist.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Route numbers for Muni are located on bus shelters. AC Transit numbers are not present, this is important since it is owl service.</li> <li>• Golden Gate Transit stop at McAllister has no lollipop. Bus shelter has an old logo, a current map, and no schedule information</li> <li>• Golden Gate and SamTrans stops associated with the Civic Center are not clearly defined.</li> </ul>
			<b>CUSTOMER INFORMATION</b>
Yes	No	N/A	
			<b>Regional Transit Information (RTIC)</b>
5	3		<p>26. Transit information in Regional Transit Information Display Cases is accurate and easy to read.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• RTICs are easy to read but some information is outdated and not coordinated.</li> <li>• Station Area Map and BART map do not show bus stops in the vicinity.</li> </ul>
5	1		<p>27. Transit operator and route maps for the nine-county San Francisco Bay Area are posted in the Regional Transit Information Display Cases.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Usual BART Map, Golden Gate Transit, Muni and SamTrans</li> <li>• Information in cases is not all the same. One map at UN Plaza is good including bus stop locations</li> </ul>

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS - CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION

			<b>Local Transit Information</b>
5	1		<p><b>28.</b> Hub specific information is provided in a case adjacent to the Regional Transit Information Display Case and at other critical locations at the hub.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Only at RTIC- No other location, no information on where to board buses</li> <li>• Yes, next to the regular transit but not too many other spaces.</li> </ul>
6			<p><b>29.</b> Hub layout maps are provided in the hub information display case.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Good bus loading maps but somewhat difficult to read and outdated</li> <li>• Maps for BART are not too detailed</li> </ul>
6			<p><b>30.</b> Map of hub vicinity with landmarks and attractions is posted in the hub information case.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Maps are present and for the most part up to date at BART/Muni Station exists</li> </ul>
4	2		<p><b>31.</b> Posted transit information (i.e. maps, schedules) is well maintained, accurate and easy to find.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Golden Gate Transit and SamTrans information is out of date.</li> <li>• BART and Muni information is current.</li> <li>• Not all transit information is easy to find.</li> <li>• The main regional area is very good (e.g. Muni maps show bus stop locations, but is out of date for SamTrans stop locations)</li> </ul>
4	1		<p><b>32.</b> Schedules, fare, transfer information and hub layout maps are located near bus stops and loading platforms.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Some schedule information is located on concourse levels and Muni at curb bus stops</li> <li>• Information is located by the Main BART and underground Muni Station.</li> </ul>
2	2		<p><b>33.</b> Printed schedules and maps distributed at the hub contain accurate information and are consistent with the information provided in the Regional Transit Information Display Cases.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Few or no maps for distribution. Kiosks are empty</li> <li>• BART train schedules in information booth and not at entrances</li> <li>• There is no good information about where the connecting transit is in the BART station/regional area.</li> <li>• Muni maps have good information for bus locations but the route information is not available. A system map of the lines serving the station would be very helpful.</li> </ul>

## HUB REVIEW FINDINGS – CIVIC CENTER BART/Muni STATION

			REAL-TIME SIGNAGE
Yes	No	N/A	
			Existing Real-Time Signage
5	1		34. Real-time signage is provided at the hub.
			35. Location of signs (indicate on station diagram). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• At Muni station agent booth. Limited information.</li> <li>• BART platform signs and BART agent booth</li> </ul>
			36. Description and photo of signage types.
			37. Identification of transit services included on real-time signage (Include operator and mode).
			Future Real-Time Signage Installations
			38. Describe location(s) for future real-time signage locations (indicate on station diagram). Refer to Appendix A Real-Time Technology Guidelines page A-24
			39. Describe transit services that would be included in real-time signage displays. Refer to Appendix A pages A-24-26.